EL DORADO COUNTY GRAND JURY, 2013-2014

**EL DORADO COUNTY FAILS TO ENFORCE ITS**
**GRADING, EROSION AND SEDIMENT CONTROL ORDINANCE**

Case Number GJ-13/14-18

**REASON FOR REPORT**

The Grand Jury received a number of complaints involving improper grading of private property. Three specific complaints were investigated and addressed in three separate reports. One involves grading of a rural property, another involves grading of a suburban property and the third is grading by a commercial property owner. In each instance, persons other than the property owner suffered damage as a result of the county’s failure to ensure compliance with its Grading Ordinance. The investigations of those cases caused the Grand Jury to question if there was a pattern and practice of failing to comply with the County Grading Ordinance.

The Grand Jury found that it did.

**BACKGROUND**

**The Ordinance**

The El Dorado County Grading, Erosion, and Sediment Control Ordinance (hereinafter “the Ordinance”)

...for the purpose of regulating grading within the unincorporated area of El Dorado County to safeguard life, limb, health, property and public welfare; to avoid pollution of watercourses; and to ensure that the intended use of a graded site is consistent with the El Dorado County General Plan, any Specific Plans adopted thereto, the adopted Storm Water Management Plan, California Fire Safe Standards and applicable El Dorado County ordinances including the Zoning Ordinance and the California Building Code. (Section 15.14.110)

“This ordinance shall be implemented and enforced by the County...” (emphasis added)

A grading permit is required for all grading activities in the unincorporated area of El Dorado County unless a specific exemption applies. (Sections 15.14.130 and 15.14.140). An exemption did not apply to any of the specific instances investigated by the Grand Jury.

The Ordinance requires permit applications to include specific informational items. (Section 15.14.200)

Fees collected when a permit is issued are used to fund enforcement of the Ordinance. Violation fees of twice the regular permit fees are required whenever grading is done in violation of the Ordinance or without an approved permit. The language of the Ordinance is not discretionary; It mandates that this violation fee be charged. (Section 15.14.230 E)

It prohibits grading activities that cause or have the potential to result in itemized hazards including a threat to neighboring property or degradation of water quality. (Section 15.14.290)

The county is authorized to enter private property and conduct work necessary to abate and repair hazards from unlawfully created conditions. The County may conduct such work either using its own
employees or through a licensed contractor. The County is required to bill the property owner for costs incurred and is authorized to recover those costs through a lien on the property and other legal means. (Section 15.14.410)

**Enforcement of the Ordinance**

Review of the permit application and subsequent inspection of the grading site only happens after permit fees are paid. Otherwise, no action is taken. When work is initiated without a valid permit a stop work order may be issued. If work is completed prior to issuance of a stop work order or if work continues without a valid permit, there is no inspection of the work done. Thus, someone who wants to perform work not authorized by county ordinances could well decide to not seek a permit in order to get away with that unauthorized work.

County employees interviewed were aware of the legal authority to charge violation fees but not that those fees were mandatory rather than discretionary. Further, violation fees were rarely charged and suggested that it would discourage the public from seeking a permit and encourage performing work without proper permits.

County employees were unaware of the County’s authority to conduct necessary remedial work at the property owner’s expense and knew of no instance when this action was taken.

**Why is the Grading Ordinance Not Enforced?**

Grading in violation of the Grading Ordinance resulted in substantial harm to property owners adjacent to or affected by improper grading in each of the cases investigated by the Grand Jury. The Grading Ordinance gives the Department of Transportation significant authority to correct improper grading. This authority could be a very effective tool for protecting other affected property owners if it were used, but it is not .... Why not?

Both County staff and officials reported that they perceived it to be the will of the Board of Supervisors that the Ordinance not be enforced. They stated that El Dorado is a property rights county; the will of the Board of Supervisors is that property owners not be burdened by strict compliance with requirements perceived to be onerous for some property owners. Several witnesses reported they believed the Ordinance imposed excessive burdens on property owners maintaining rural access roads

The public appears to understand that the Ordinance is not enforced. Neither of the contractors who performed illegal grading in Report No. 13-15 or 13-16 felt required to obtain a permit for the grading they performed. In Report No. 13-16 the Contractor appears to have understood that if he failed to pay the fee for a grading permit no action would be taken to enforce the terms of the permit.

The Ordinance is quite specific “...to safeguard life, limb, health, property and public welfare; to avoid pollution of watercourses...” The Grading Ordinance of the County of El Dorado is Chapter 15.14 of the County Code; it is the law of El Dorado County. Failure to enforce the Ordinance is failure to enforce the law; that failure benefits property owners who act unlawfully while denying the law’s specific protections to others. It leads to a perception of corruption on the part of County officials and general disrespect for County government.
**ACTIONS**

- The Grand Jury reviewed the El Dorado County Grading, Erosion and Sediment Control Ordinance.
- The Grand Jury interviewed private parties who complained to having been adversely affected by the County’s failure to enforce the Ordinance.
- The Grand Jury interviewed County employees responsible for implementing and enforcing the Ordinance.

**FINDINGS**

1. When grading work is done in El Dorado County and no permit is obtained and no permit fee paid, and the county is made aware of the work being done before the work is complete, the county will issue a stop work order.

2. When work improperly continues after issuance of a stop work order or if work is completed before a stop work order is issued, no enforcement action is taken.

3. Only payment of a permit fee triggers inspection of grading work performed.

4. Grading work performed where no permit fee is paid is not inspected.

5. El Dorado County does not enforce its Grading, Erosion and Sediment Control Ordinance.

6. The County’s failure to enforce its Grading, Erosion and Sediment Control Ordinance encourages illegal grading to the detriment of other property owners and residents.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. The Board of Supervisors should review the Grading, Erosion and Sediment Control Ordinance and determine whether the Ordinance imposes overly burdensome requirements for rural access roads.

2. If the Board of Supervisors determines the requirements for grading of rural access roads are overly burdensome, it should amend the Ordinance to define appropriate requirements for the grading of those roads.

3. Whether or not the Ordinance is amended, the Grading, Erosion and Sediment Control Ordinance should be enforced.
RESPONSES

Responses to both findings and recommendations in this Report are required by law in accordance with California Penal Code §933 and §933.05. Address responses to:

The Honorable Suzanne N. Kingsbury, presiding judge of the El Dorado County Superior Court, 1354 Johnson Blvd., South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150.

This Report has been provided to the El Dorado County Board of Supervisors, Development Services Department and Department of Transportation.

The Presiding Judge of the El Dorado County Superior Court additionally requests that the responses be sent electronically as a “Word” file or “PDF” file to facilitate the economical and timely distribution of such responses. Please email responses to the El Dorado County Grand Jury at:
courtadmin@eldoradocourt.org